



HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

2 Fairgrounds Road
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554
www.nantucket-ma.gov

Commissioners: Linda Williams (Chair), Dawn Hill-Holdgate (Vice-chair), John McLaughlin, David Barham, Diane Coombs
Associate Commissioners: Jascin Leonardo-Finger, Abigail Camp **Staff:** Mark Voigt, James Grieder

~~ MINUTES ~~

September 24, 2013 – NEW BUSINESS

Public Safety Facility, 4 Fairgrounds Road, Training Room –5:00 p.m.

Called to order at 5:06 p.m.

Staff in attendance: J. Grieder, HDC Assistant Administrator; T. Norton, Town Minutes Taker

Attending Members: Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger

Absent Members: Camp

Late Arrivals: Coombs 5:41; Barham 5:52; Hill-Holdgate 7:09

Early Departures: Barham 7:53; Hill-Holdgate 8:55; McLaughlin 8:57

Agenda adopted by unanimous consent

I. PUBLIC COMMENT

Victory Ewing, LINK Permitting and Design – Sign application: the application was inadvertently missed the first go-around and SAC did not meet this week; she doesn't want to make her client wait another week. **To go on the September 26 agenda.**

II. CONSENT

1. Hartrick, Michael – 60231	2 N. Liberty Street – HSAB	Revisions: deck	42.3.4-86	SMRD
2. Duty – 60232	5 Warren Street – HSAB	Hardscaping: fence, gate, arbor	55.4.1-93	M. Ahern
3. Schafer, Louisa – 60233	5 New Mill Street – HSAB	Color change: trim, color	55.4.4-8	Joyner
4. Hobbs, S. – 60234	46 N. Liberty Street – HSAB	Color change	41-259	M. Boiske
5. Fryer, Dorothy – 60235	107R Orange Street – HSAB	Front door	12-60	J. Manning
6. Curruthers-Weiss – 60236	38 Burnell Street – SAB	Hardscaping: driveway, patio	73-123	Atlantic Landscp.
7. Santarelli, Philip – 60237	23R Bank Street – SAB	Extend deck, window change	73.1.3-52	Bentley/Churchill
8. O'Donnell, Lauren – 60238	12 Fishers Landing – MAB	Roof change	38-14.6	D. Kane
9. Old Gray Barn – 60239	36 Goldfinch Drive	Color change	68-614	Williams
10. Falis, Alice – 60240	10 Meadow View Drive	Roof change	56-146	Danmy
11. Dammers, Steven – 60241	104 Polpis Road	Remove prev. app'd. addition	44-122	NAG
12. Pokoik – 60242	1 Delaney Road	Shed	41-619	Structures Unltd.
13. Garrett, Richard – 60243	20 Monomoy Road	Roof change	54-145	R. Simpson
14. MacDonald, Mike – 60244	177 Eel Point Road	Remove window	33-26	V. Oliver
15. Bonmeiser, Stuart – 60245	28 Crooked Lane	New foundation	41-333	V. Oliver
16. Pope, Russell – 60246	6 The Captains Lane	Demo garage	30-67	Self
17. Pope, Russell – 60247	6 The Captains Lane	Demo greenhouse	30-67	Self
18. Marsh, Gregory – 60248	34 Friendship Lane	Reroof: material change	56-334	Self
19. Percelay, Bruce – 60249	15 N. Beach Street	Color change	42.4.1-66	S. Andersen
20. Lampe, John – 60250	97 Cliff Road	Color change	30-170.1	Self
21. Bloomstone – 60251	7 Austin Locke	Replace deck	82-51	Self

Sitting Williams, McLaughlin, Leonardo-Finger

Alternates None

Recused None

Documentation File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.

Representing None

Public None

Concerns No commissioner concerns.

Motion **Motion to Approve. (McLaughlin)**

Vote Carried unanimously

Certificate #

60231 to 60251

III. NEW BUSINESS

1. Duty	5 Warren Street – HSAB	Hardscaping: shower, A/C	55.4.1-93	M. Ahern
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Leonardo-Finger			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Miroslava Ahern – Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(5:12) Staff – Read applications specifications and HSAB – East elevation, too much mass stuck on visible side of the house; the outdoor shower is also not appropriate for visible side; both should be located in the rear of the house Leonardo-Finger – Agree with HSAB, needs a different location. Can go on the other building. McLaughlin – No comments. (7:07) reopened to change the motion to hold.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff without the outdoor shower and AC to be placed on the western side of the garage and screened with a natural to weather board fence, per Exhibit A. (Leonardo-Finger) Carried unanimously Motion to reopen and reconsider Item 1, Duty. (Leonardo-Finger) Carried unanimously Motion to Hold for revisions. (Leonardo-Finger)			
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	
2. VanDenBorn, Simon	14 Still Dock Unit #1 – HSAB	Rev: condenser placement	42.3.1-84.5	C. Carey
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Leonardo-Finger			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Chris Carey – Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(5:17) Staff – Read application specifications. HSAB – Should remain where previous approved or enclosed in a boxed lattice.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with natural to weather boxed lattice in position two. (McLaughlin)			
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate # 60252	
3. Beardsley, Scott	138 Main Street – HSAB	Hardscaping: solar panels	41-521	Self
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Leonardo-Finger			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Jeff Remick – Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(5:19) Staff – Read applicant HSAB – probably okay but view for visibility; would like a photo of house for context.			
Motion	Motion to View for visibility from Vestal without comment. (Leonardo-Finger)			
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	

4. Philbrick	4 Silver Street – HSAB	Addition	55.4.1-165	Permits Plus
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Leonardo-Finger			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Mark Poor , Permits Plus – Presented project. South side 2-over-2 windows are new and should be circled.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(5:22) Held for the representative. (5:30) Staff – Read application specifications. HSAB – Main chimney should not be moved. There appear to be window changes on south side that are not on the application. McLaughlin – No comments. Leonardo-Finger – The chimney needs to remain; it's strange not to have a main mass chimney on an 1830 house. Dormer on the rear elevation is a little wrong. Williams – Agree about the rear dormer; but it should remain simple and not have returns. The 2-over-2 windows are not appropriate with the 6-over-6 windows; they are a good size for 6-over-6. Keep the windows the same size but align with windows above. No issue with the subterranean stuff going on. West elevation dormer 2-over-2 windows should remain 6-over-6. Agree about removing the main mass chimney.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with 6-over-6 windows in place of the 2-over-2, keeping the chimney, and removing the returns off the dormer. (McLaughlin)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	60253	
5. Sanford, Henry	14 Old North Wharf – HSAB	Repair	42.3.1-252	Twig Perkins
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Leonardo-Finger			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns	(5:23) Staff – Read application specifications. HSAB – Need window survey and proposed drawings to see where work is being done.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for further information and representation. (Leonardo-Finger)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		
6. Nickerson, Sybil	4 Topaz Circle	Hardscaping: pool	66-239	G. Doren
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Leonardo-Finger			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Charles Lewis – Presented project and explained where the fence will be located.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(5:25) Staff – Read application specifications. McLaughlin – Questions visibility from Bartlett Road. Williams – Not visible.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff per Exhibit A with the 5-foot board natural to weather fence location connecting the two houses. (McLaughlin)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	60254	

7.	Dunphy, Maureen	32 Tennessee Avenue – MAB	Hardscaping: walkway	60.1.2-32/41	L. Thornewill
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Leonardo-Finger				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.				
Representing	None				
Public	None				
Concerns	(5:39) Staff – Read application specifications. Read letter from the owner. No comments at this time.				
Motion	Motion to View. (Leonardo-Finger)				
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #		
8.	Brant Point Partners LLC	23 Walsh Street	Rev: COA #60099	42.4.1-105	B. Meerbergen
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.				
Representing	Brook Meerbergen – Presented project.				
Public	None				
Concerns	(5:40) Staff – Read application specifications. Leonardo-Finger – Asked that the previously approved be included on the drawings. No concerns.				
Motion	Motion to Approve. (McLaughlin)				
Vote	Carried		Certificate #	60255	
9.	Brant Point Partners LLC	21 Walsh Street	Rev: COA #60098	42.4.1-106	B. Meerbergen
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.				
Representing	Brook Meerbergen – Presented project.				
Public	None				
Concerns	(5:40) Staff – Read application specifications. No concerns.				
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Coombs)				
Vote	Carried		Certificate #	60256	
IV. OLD BUSINESS (HELD FOR QUORUM)					
1.	Traynor	13B Willard Street	Deck	68-509	SCI/Newman, Rob
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Coombs				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.				
Representing	(5:11) Kevin Dale , Vaughan, Dale, Hunter and Beaudette, P.C. – Asked it held until Coombs arrived. Rob Newman , Sandcastle Construction Inc. – Reviewed changes per previous concerns. Precedent photos in regards to the dormer.				
Public	None				
Concerns	(5:48) Staff – Read previous concerns from September 3. No concerns.				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the skirt natural to weather with ¾ inch spacing. (Coombs)				
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	60257	

2.	Houlihan/Morash	13 Hedgebury Ln	Dwelling	60.2.1-6	V. Oliver
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.				
Representing	Val Oliver Jeff Morash				
Public	None				
Concerns	(5:53) Staff – September 3 sitting: Williams, Coombs & Camp No Quorum.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for very beginning of October 1 agenda. (Coombs)				
Vote	Carried unanimously Certificate #				
3.	Houlihan/Morash	13 Hedgebury Lane	Cabana	60.2.1-6	V. Oliver
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Coombs				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.				
Representing	Val Oliver – Reviewed changes per previous concerns. Jeff Morash				
Public	None				
Concerns	(5:55) Staff – Read previous concerns from September 3. No concerns.				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with Cobblestone trim and Essex green door and sash and the 4-lights fixed. (Coombs)				
Vote	Carried unanimously Certificate # 60258				
4.	Houlihan/Morash	13 Hedgebury Lane	Hardscaping: pool	60.2.1-6	V. Oliver
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Coombs				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.				
Representing	Val Oliver – Reviewed changes per previous concerns. Jeff Morash				
Public	None				
Concerns	(5:59) Staff – Read previous concerns from September 3. No Concerns.				
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Coombs)				
Vote	Carried unanimously Certificate # 60259				
5.	Dickerson, Sarah	7 West Creek Road	Add two skylights	55-167	S. Paradis
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.				
Representing	None				
Public	None				
Concerns	(6:01) Staff – Read previous concerns from September 3. No concerns.				
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Coombs)				
Vote	Carried unanimously Certificate # 60260				

6. Ribik, Joan	12 Chuck Hollow Road	Porch & door	72-29	V. Oliver
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Coombs			
Alternates	None			
Recused	Leonardo-Finger			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Val Oliver – Reviewed changes per previous concerns.			
Public	Leonardo-Finger , 10 Chuck Hollow Road – Agree about the porch, it will help. Gazebo is not appropriate. The rear elevation dormer is more appropriate. The front dormer is too massive for the tiny house and should be broken up into two. Small window in the center should be removed. White trim isn't appropriate on this house; should be gray or natural and prefer the 6-over-6 windows.			
Concerns	(6:03) Staff – Read previous concerns from August 13. Coombs – Agree about the front dormer. Porch extends too far. This is a simple house and the gazebo is not appropriate. Asked about the east elevation shed dormer. House looks like it should have 6-over-6 windows. McLaughlin – The 8-light windows in the dormer should be fixed or hopper. Williams – Share many of the same concerns. This house should not have shingled rails and the octagon element and 2-over-2 windows are inappropriate. Front flush dormer is too low on the roof. Rear dormer should be a full dormer with a full window.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Coombs)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		

7. 76 Main St LLC	76 Main Street – HSAB	H/C lift	42.3.1-111	Self
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Leonardo-Finger			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Matt MacEachern , Emeritus Development – Reviewed changes per previous concerns. Scott Andersen			
Public	None			
Concerns	(6:15) Staff – Read previous concerns from September 3. Williams – The casements are not appropriate. Leonardo-Finger – Agrees about the casements, they look odd next to the little 6-pane pieces. McLaughlin – No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with basements windows to be 6-over-6 double hung. (Leonardo-Finger)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	60261	

8. Vogel, Gary	22 Blackfish Lane – SAB	Cottage	73-133	Emeritus
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Matt MacEachern , Emeritus Development – Request Vogel applications be held.			
Public	None			
Concerns	No commissioner comments at this time.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for beginning of October 1 meeting. (McLaughlin)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		

9. Vogel, Gary	22 Blackfish Lane – SAB	Garage	73-133	Emeritus
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Matt MacEachern , Emeritus Development – Request Vogel applications be held.			
Public	None			
Concerns	No commissioner comments at this time.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for beginning of October 1 meeting. (McLaughlin)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		

10. Vogel, Gary	22 Blackfish Lane – SAB	Pool	73-133	Emeritus
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Matt MacEachern , Emeritus Development – Request Vogel applications be held.			
Public	None			
Concerns	No commissioner comments at this time.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for beginning of October 1 meeting. (McLaughlin)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		
11. 2-4 Chins Way LLC	2-4 Chins Way	Revisions	55-162	BPC
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Joe Paul , BPC – Reviewed changes per previous concerns.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(6:20) Staff – Read previous concerns from September 3. McLaughlin – Okay with Cottage red doors and sash stays white.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with doors and trim Cottage red and sashes stay white. (Leonardo-Finger)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	60262	
12. Levenson	32 Nonantum Avenue	Revisons: pool	87-22	BPC
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Joe Paul , BPC – Reviewed changes per previous concerns.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(6:24) Staff – Read previous concerns from September 3. Coombs – Need year-round planting on outside of fence			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with year-round vegetated planting plan on outside of board fence bordering Pequot. (Coombs)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	60263	
13. Levenson	50 Nonantum Avenue	Revisons: pool	87-38.1	BPC
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Joe Paul , BPC – Reviewed changes per previous concerns.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(6:24) Staff – Read previous concerns from September 3. Coombs – No visibility. Williams – Asked for the same motion as for 32.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with year-round vegetated planting plan on outside of board fence bordering Lover's Lane. (Coombs)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	60264	

14. Oak Hill Investment	7 South Valley Road	Revisions: dwelling	43-143	Emeritus
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Matt MacEachern, Emeritus Development			
Public	None			
Concerns	(6:31) No commissioner comments at this time.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for beginning of October 1 agenda. (McLaughlin)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		
15. Oak Hill Investment	7 S. Valley Road	Tracking: pool	43-143	Emeritus
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Matt MacEachern, Emeritus Development			
Public	None			
Concerns	(6:31) No commissioner comments at this time.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for beginning of October 1 agenda. (McLaughlin)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		
16. Oak Hill Investment	7 S. Valley Road	Tracking: garage/studio	43-143	Emeritus
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Matt MacEachern, Emeritus Development			
Public	None			
Concerns	(6:31) No commissioner comments at this time.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for beginning of October 1 agenda. (McLaughlin)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		
17. Oak Hill Investment	7 S. Valley Road	Tracking: shed/cabana	43-143	Emeritus
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Matt MacEachern, Emeritus Development			
Public	None			
Concerns	(6:31) No commissioner comments at this time.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for beginning of October 1 agenda. (McLaughlin)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		

18. Westfall	30 Monomoy Road	Rev: COA #58836	54-210	CWA
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Coombs			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Chip Webster , Chip Webster Architecture – Reviewed changes per previous concerns and brought the previous approval.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(6:31) Staff – Read previous concerns from Sept 3 Coombs – The “B” window panes should be more rectangular, but that could be the CAD. North elevation, the previously approved had a 2-window dormer which was better than this proposal. McLaughlin – South elevation left, casement windows in the dormer are inappropriate; should be fixed or hoppers. Williams – Roof walk is not properly located. Trim on the gables is too heavy. French doors should be 6-lights.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the south elevation dormer to have 4-light hoppers, roof walk skirt natural to weather with 1¼-inch spacing, gable trim to match existing, north elevation 3rd-floor dormer to remain unchanged and French doors all to be 6-lights. (Coombs)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	60265	
19. 23 Commercial Whf NT	23 Commercial Whf – HSAB	Renovation/addition	42.2.4-5	Rowland Assoc.
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Mickey Rowland , Rowland and Associates – Reviewed changes made to this new submittal since September 3. Kevin Dale, Vaughan, Dale, Hunter and Beaudette, P.C.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(6:43) Staff – Project was resubmitted to get a full board. McLaughlin – No concerns. Coombs – Along the public walkway, asked if the railing would go all the way around natural to weather? (Answer: yes) West elevation bedroom windows seem high. Leonardo-Finger – No additional comments. Barham – Continues to feel it is not appropriate. Moving the building off the wharf is unfortunate, Commercial Wharf is losing its historic character with the loss of smaller buildings. Access to the balcony makes it a party deck not in keeping the Chapter 91. Massing is atypical to Nantucket. Should be scaled back and reconfigured. Suggested creating a dock instead of a 16-foot deep deck that looks like a private party deck. Williams – The overhang on the 2 nd -floor bathroom addition should be removed.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the 2nd-floor addition overhang made a flush rake. (McLaughlin)			
Vote	Carried 2-1/ Barham opposed / Coombs & Leonardo-Finger abstain	Certificate #	60626	
Break 6:56 to 7:08 p.m.				

IV. DISCUSSION

1. Discussion of revised plans for Cienava and appeal.

Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs	
Alternates	Leonardo-Finger	
Recused	None	
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.	
Representing	Steven Cohen , Reade, Gullicksen, Hanley, Gifford & Cohen LLP – His client would like to come to a compromise design. This is not an application, merely a discussion as to whether or not it is heading in the right direction. His client is still willing to pursue the constructive approval. The property is away from the plains and set in a gully though in proximity with new-design structures that are not low and rambling. If this is heading in the right direction, his client is willing to work with HDC; otherwise he will pursue the constructive approval.	
Public	Sarah Alger , Sarah F. Alger P.C., direct abutter – Would prefer not to have to go forward with an appeal; her client would like to see Mr. Cienava get an approval on a more appropriate design.	
Concerns	(7:19) Williams – Stated she has gone out to the site with Mr. Cohen and the architect. The HDC is appealing the Constructive Grant approval on the house only. Applicant still willing to try to move the project closer to something the HDC would approve. Applicant is willing to join the HDC and Ms Alger to ask the Board of Selectmen (BOS) to postpone the appeal. Hill-Holdgate – It is improved. There are four locations of negative masses. The ridge lines drop but eave lines don't. The 1-story gambrel piece on east elevation to the right should be changed to a shed. Still has problems with the presence of the turret, it is an atypical element found on Nantucket. The rounded windows on west and east are still inappropriate. Perhaps the turret would be acceptable if it were lower and not visible over the roof. Barham – Agreeable to the premise that the design take the approach of a rambling shingle-style gambrel; these sketches have notably far. Agree with Ms Hill-Holdgate. East elevation right of entry gambrel, there needs to be a relationship between the double dormers and windows below. The garage doors should be squared off and windows in the dormers separated and in the far left of the east elevation. Fenestration on the left gable at the ground floor is three different sizes. Columns should be no more than 12 inches, 10 would be better; smaller double columns would be acceptable; the point is to get the columns to look more residential than like something found on a church. The two 6-light windows either side of the arch are awkward. West elevation dormer left of the main gambrel needs to be set back 3 feet and on the gambrel side there is there is a condition where it is impacting the side of the gambrel. In the wing left of the gambrel, there is a 1 st -story bumpout with shed dormers sitting on top; that is a condition that does not exist on the Island. The balcony on the far left cuts into the gambrel is not successful. There are a number of features that are razzle-dazzle, to include the turret and the 12-foot wide half round are widely over the top, which are not normally found on Nantucket. Also, the turret is wide and squat and competes with the main gambrel. Coombs – Nothing to add. Don't want the cupola on top of the turret. Leonardo-Finger – Agree with Mr. Barham and Ms Hill-Holdgate. McLaughlin – No comment. Williams – Agree with what's been said. The cupola has to come off then he wouldn't have to wrap it. Too many 6-light windows; they are normally accent windows. The shingled walls are too high. The garage would be better separated from the house. The main mass is 50 feet and the secondary mass on the east elevation is also 50 feet and should be shorter. The wrap-around porch with columns doesn't help the turret. Cohen – Based upon the comments made, thinks his client will be willing to work with the board.	
Motion	Motion to have the chair send a memo to the BOS asking for the appeal to be postponed until November 6. (Coombs)	
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #

2. Kielly, James	26 Gosnold Rd	Rev to 60081 move//demo	30-89	Botticelli & Pohl
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Ray Pohl , Botticelli & Pohl – Reviewed the history of this main house project with the HDC. Recently more demands have been placed upon the move. Asking for the board to revote to allow a demolition. Sarah Alger , Sarah F. Alger P.C. – Still hoping the house can be moved; but just want to have the ability should the move fall apart.			
Public	Susan Viano – Is taking the house and stated she has gone through great lengths to make this work out. (7:53) Williams – Original application was for a demolition or move and was approved as a demo or move. Now issues have occurred about moving this big house across the Graves' property; can't go down Gosnold at all. Hill-Holdgate – This board needs to make a finding that the house has been so substantially altered that it is not longer historic. McLaughlin – They have a permit that has been issued. Coombs – Okay with coming back with an application to demolish. Leonardo-Finger – Wants the information before making a call.			
Concerns				
Motion	None			
Vote	N/A Certificate #			

(8:03) Motion to View the following new business items without discussion and poles to be determined through staff.

(Coombs) Carried unanimously/Hill-Holdgate recused

1. Delano, Chris	5 Longwood Drive	New barn	71-45	K. Snell
2. Wilson, Steve	5 Surfside Road	New dwelling	55-253	K. Snell
3. Attapreyangkul, T.	3 Monohansett Avenue	New dwelling	79-150.1	V. Oliver
4. Cross, Mary	4 Hulbert Avenue	Addition	42.1.4-2	E. McMorro
5. Powers, Chris	69 Surfside Road (Lot A)	New dwelling	67-230	D. Gardenier
6. Block-Kelley	3 Sherburne Turnpike	Demo garage/studio	30-114	Botticelli & Pohl
7. Block-Kelley	3 Sherburne Turnpike	New garage/studio	30-114	Botticelli & Pohl
8. Fallon	16 Starbuck Road	Addition: dormer	60-115	BPC
9. Knutson	9 Dunham Street	Garage	80-196	BPC
10. Knutson	9 Dunham Street	Hardscaping: pool	80-196	BPC
11. Knutson	9 Dunham Street	Cabana	80-196	BPC

V. OLD BUSINESS CONTINUED

20. Burns	24 Nonantum Avenue	New dwelling	87-157	Emeritus
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Hill-Holdgate			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Matt MacEachern , Emeritus Development – Reviewed changes per previous concerns.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(6:14) No quorum held for Hill-Holdgate (8:05) Staff – Read previous concerns from Sept 5. Williams – This is getting worse. Hill-Holdgate – Shed dormers are appropriate but much too big. The 2 nd floor deck above the front door has been an issue since day 1; it should come off some other side. North elevation, shed dormers need to be reduced; 2 nd mass has a drop in the ridge line, the eave line needs to drop as well. McLaughlin – The “D” & “E” windows are listed as awnings and have requested they be changed to hopper or fixed and that has not been done. None of the meeting rails align. Williams – Agree with Ms Hill-Holdgate about the dormers, none of them are not successful at all. The plate height should come down. Windows are not aligned. Main mass to 2 nd mass needs to break more. We do not approve two triple-ganged dormers on the front of the structure.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Hill-Holdgate)			
Vote	Carried unanimously Certificate #			

21. Soren Sorenson	21 Woodbine Street	Cabana	80-321	Emeritus
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Matt MacEachern , Emeritus Development – Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns	Hold for Hill-Holdgate			

(8:14) **Staff** – Read previous concerns from August 22.

Hill-Holdgate – Trim is too heavy.

McLaughlin – No comments at this time.

Williams – The trim is way out of whack and should not be white; trim should be appropriately scaled to this structure.

Motion **Motion to Hold for revisions. (Hill-Holdgate)**

Vote Carried unanimously Certificate #

Discussion about applications moved to Thursday

VI. NEW BUSINESS – continued

12. Minella, Amy	8 Giny Lane	Hardscaping	82-51	W. Yost
------------------	-------------	-------------	-------	---------

Sitting Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger

Alternates None

Recused None

Documentation File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.

Representing **Bill Yost** – Presented project.

Public None

Concerns (7:08) Staff Read applications specifications.

Barham – Stated that the commission should be very sure that the last house does not have a grade change; up to now, the board has been very lenient about houses going in on grades higher than approved. The drawings should be corrected to scale.

McLaughlin – Concerned that the 3-foot grade change will result in a retaining wall. (Yost: it is a gradual slope.) Would like to view it.

Leonardo-Finger & Coombs – No concerns.

Motion **Motion to View with revisions and corrected drawings. (Barham)**

Vote Carried unanimously Certificate #

13. Mayopoulos	10 Magnolia Avenue – SAB	Rev: windows	73.3.1-59	A. MacLeod
----------------	--------------------------	--------------	-----------	------------

Sitting Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger

Alternates None

Recused None

Documentation File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.

Representing **Angus MacLeod** – Presented project.

Public None

Concerns (8:22) **Staff** – Read application specifications.

SAB – No concerns.

No concerns.

Motion **Motion to Approve. (Hill-Holdgate)**

Vote Carried 4-0/McLaughlin abstain Certificate # 60267

14. Nantucket Land Bank	4 Codfish Park Rd – SAB	Hardscaping: playground	73.2.4-42	GDC
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Julie Jordin , The Garden Design Company – Presented project. Her client believes that they have made an effort to design something that is in keeping with Nantucket and is “green”. Everything is handicapped (H/C) accessible.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(8:26) Staff – Read application specifications. SAB – Grotesque, this is in the heart of the ‘Sconset old-historic district, not a mini golf course. Simplicity should be the starting point. Hill-Holdgate – Appreciate the wood and that it is natural to weather. Believe it is appropriate. McLaughlin – From 1933 to 1963 there was just the beach and two swings. Would like to take another view. Coombs – Likes the swings. Leonardo-Finger – It is too much. Williams – Several pieces of apparatus are not H/C accessible.			
Motion	Motion to View. (Coombs)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		
15. Canty, C.	56 Cato Lane	Hardscaping: pool/patio/fence	55-111	Self
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Chris Canty – Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(8:38) Staff – Read application specifications. No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with patio and gates as shown on Exhibit A. (McLaughlin)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	60268	
16. McGeown, C.	13 Derrymore Lane	Material change: roof	41-240	M. Bourke
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Martin Bourke			
Public	None			
Concerns	(8:44) Staff – Read application specifications. No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Hill-Holdgate)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	60269	
17. Sackton/Butman	12 Hinckley Lane	Renovation	30-230	C. Thornewill
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Carrie Thornewill , Thornewill Design – Presented project			
Public	None			
Concerns	(8:45) Staff Read application specifications. No comments at this time.			
Motion	Motion to View. (Coombs)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		

18. Benenson, Bill	44 Vestal Street	Window/door changes	41-54	S. Flegg
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Carrie Thornewill , Thornewill Design – Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(8:47) Staff – Read application specifications. McLaughlin – The “C” windows are awnings and he believes they are visible. No other commissioners had concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Hill-Holdgate)			
Vote	Carried 4-0/McLaughlin abstain	Certificate #	60270	
19. Pongrace, Donald	78 Polpis Road	Hardscaping: fire pit	44-25.7	Atlantic Landscap.
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Lindsey Congelton , Atlantic Landscaping – Presented project			
Public	None			
Concerns	(8:51) Staff – Read application specifications.			
Motion	Motion to Approve due to lack of visibility. (Hill-Holdgate)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	60271	
20. Shevalier, Dix	21 Chuck Hollow Road	Return to COA #58490	75-3	Self
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Dix Shevalier – Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(8:52) Staff – Read application specifications. Discussion about whether or not the applicant needed to apply or can simply withdraw the last approval.			
Motion	Motion to Allow the withdrawal of COA 58680. (Hill-Holdgate)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		
21. Blackfin Partners	27 Ellens Way	Revisions: pool	81-6	M. Ahern
Sitting	Williams, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger			
Alternates	None			
Recused	Hill-Holdgate			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Miroslava Ahern – Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(8:57) Staff – Read application specifications. No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Coombs)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	60272	

22. Blatt, David	47 Brewster Road	Hardscaping: gate	54-16	Atlantic Landscp.
Sitting	Williams, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Lindsey Congelton , Atlantic Landscaping – Presented project			
Public	None			
Concerns	(8:59) Staff – Read application specifications. Leonardo-Finger – The exposed section of fence should be board natural to weather.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the exposed part of the wire fence to be 4’ natural to weather board. (Leonardo-Finger)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	60273	

23. Sheridan, Paul	17 Blackfish Lane – SAB	Hardscaping: pool	73-109	Atlantic Landscp.
Sitting	Williams, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Lindsey Congelton , Atlantic Landscaping – Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(9:02) Staff – Read application specifications. SAB – No concerns. No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Coombs)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	60274	

24. Dahl, Diane	36 Baxter Road – SAB	Hardscaping: pool	49.2.3-6	Champoux Lnd.
Sitting	Williams, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Ben Champoux – Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(9:05) Staff – Read application specifications. SAB – Where’s plan for dive to garage, is fill anticipated (see bluestone landing). Coombs – Flaring the edge of the driveway will prevent people driving over the curb. Bluestone should be natural cleft embedded in the grass. Leonardo-Finger – The mixture of shell and Belgium block is odd. Williams – No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the Belgium bock transition is rounded on both inside and outside and bluestone is natural cleft. (Coombs)			
Vote	Carried 2-1/Leonardo-Finger opposed	Certificate #	60275	

Motion to Hold rest of the agenda for September 26 meeting. (Coombs) Carried unanimously

25. McPhee/Gilson	147 Polpis Road	Rev: COA #56871 (cottage)	44-8	Botticelli & Pohl
26. Hughes, Tom	107 Squam	Revisions: garage doors	12-60	Self
27. Parizeau	Tuckernuck Island	Replace roof	94-1	J. Beamish
28. Glowacki, Walter	6 Lovers Lane	Hardscaping: fence	68-201	Nikki
29. Glowacki, Walter	8 Lovers Lane	Hardscaping: fence	68-200	Nikki
30. Lewis, Durvin	6 Mary Ann Drive	Hardscaping: fence, bsmnt.	68-440	B. Meerbergen
31. Wilson - Held for 9/26	5 Surfside Road	Move off: garage	55-253	Structures Unltd.
32. Glowacki	2 Greglen Avenue	Move on: garage	68-131	Structures Unltd.
33. Wilson	5 Surfside Road	Shed	55-253	Structures Unltd.
34. 4 Saratoga Ln LLC	14 Tennessee Avenue – MAB	Demo	60.1.2-6	V. Oliver
35. 4 Saratoga Ln LLC	14 Tennessee Avenue – MAB	Demo, rebuild as approved	60.1.2-6	V. Oliver
36. Sachman, Steve	132 Surfside Road	Hardscaping: pool	80-252	V. Oliver
37. Jarmer, Judy	29 Pochick Avenue	Studio	80-92	V. Oliver

Minutes for September 24, 2013, adopted Nov. 5

38. Reinemo, Karsten	14 Roberts Lane	Garage	56-24	V. Oliver
39. Reinemo, Karsten	14 Roberts Lane	Hardscaping: pool	56-24	V. Oliver
40. Hamou, Grace	48 Nonantum Avenue	Enlarge deck	87-37	V. Oliver
41. Platek, Jen	3 Cabot Lane	Shed	30-60	V. Oliver
42. Brodie, Peter	70 Sankaty Road – SAB	Addition, alterations	49-81	V. Oliver
43. Kumin	17 Head of Plains	Hardscaping: pergola, kitchen	63-56	M. Ahern
44. Jelleme	3 Pilgrim Court	Revisions: fenestration	41-612	Emeritus
45. Johnson	2 Hamblin Road	Move/demo	30-193	Emeritus
46. Johnson	2 Hamblin Road	New garage	30-193	Emeritus
47. Townsend/Clarkson	1 Grand Avenue – SAB	Porch addition, shed	73.3.1-13	Bentley/Churchill
48. Shay, Lowell	23 Clarendon Road	Back porch, shower	76.1.3-112	S. Payne
49. Joulund, LLC	32 Somerset Lane	Hardscaping: pool	66-72	V. Oliver
50. Platek, Jen	3 Cabot Lane	Hardscaping: pergola	30-60	V. Oliver
51. China Lake RT	1 Blackfish Lane – SAB	Hardscaping	73-104	Atlantic Landscp.
52. Atlas RT	212 Eel Point Road	Hardscaping: pool	38-35	Atlantic Landscp.
53. Miles, Helen	8 Crooked Lane	Garage door change	41-208	Twig Perkins
54. Tulloch	7 Village Way	Move structure		Cottage & Castle
22. Dunning	5 N. Liberty Street – HSAB	Move on-site; addition	42.3.4-7	Wesquo/Hollister

VII. OTHER BUSINESS	
Approve Minutes -	August 20 th and 22 nd , September 3 rd and 5 th
Other Business -	Next organization meeting Oct. 29 th ? (5 th Tuesday of October) Motion to post October 29 Organizational Meeting and adjust the calendar accordingly. (Leonardo-Finger) Carried unanimously
Commission Comments	

Motion to Adjourn: 9:15 p.m.

Submitted by:
Terry L. Norton

HSAB – Historic Structures Advisory Board SAB – ‘Sconset Advisory Board
TAB – Tuckernuck Advisory Board MAB – Madaket Advisory Board